

## China's Economic Development Assistance to the Philippines: A Preliminary Assessment<sup>1</sup>

*Aurora Roxas-Lim<sup>2</sup>*

The paper is a preliminary assessment of China's economic development assistance projects under its Overseas Development Assistance (ODA) program in the Philippines. Three projects – the Philippine-Sino Center for Agricultural Technology (PhilSCAT) in Muñoz, Nueva Ecija; the Banaoang Irrigation Project in Ilocos Sur; and the General Santos Fish Port in General Santos, Sarangani, Mindanao – are part of the Agriculture and Fisheries Modernization Act 8435.

<sup>1</sup> Paper presented at the forum on "The Philippines and China: In Search of Greater Maturity of Relations" organized by the Philippine Association for Chinese Studies, Richmond Hotel, Makati City, September 27, 2008. The author wishes to acknowledge the kind and generous assistance of officials from the Department of Agriculture officials, especially at PhilSCAT and PhilRice in Muñoz, Nueva Ecija; National Irrigation Authority branch office in Ilocos Sur; and Bureau of Fisheries & Aquatic Resources in Quezon City and in General Santos City. However, whatever shortcomings and errors found in this report are entirely the author's sole responsibility. Comments and suggestions to improve the paper are most welcome.

<sup>2</sup> Prof. Aurora Roxas Lim is a lecturer at the Chinese Studies Program of Ateneo de Manila University. She was former dean of the Asian Center of the University of the Philippines.

Field research was undertaken during summer vacations from 2002 to 2008 in Nueva Ecija, Ilocos Sur, and General Santos. Hence, the observations and analysis presented in this paper are limited to these years. This researcher does not claim to provide a comprehensive analysis of the three projects, much less claim that all the data are up-to-date. Subsequent developments on the success, failure, efficacy, and other outcomes of these three projects need further research.

China's Development Assistance Program increased in the 1990s when the country emerged as one of the world's leading economic and manufacturing centers in the world. This enabled her to amass at least US\$1.797 trillion reserves in 2007. To harness this huge amount of cash, China decided to invest in other countries by undertaking joint economic ventures and extend economic development assistance projects abroad. Besides promoting better and wider international relations, China is ensuring reliable sources of raw materials particularly metals, oil and natural gas and other natural resources to sustain its economic growth.

In the case of the Philippines, China initiated economic development projects in earnest in 1999 to 2000. The paper discusses three ongoing and completed projects, the terms of agreements, the agencies involved, and their respective obligations. Two other projects that are the subject of much controversy and are on hold will not be discussed, namely the extension and improvement of the north and south railway lines, and the installation of national broadband network by the Chinese corporation ZTE. These projects have been kept on hold, if not cancelled completely.

The paper brings up implications on future studies on the impact of a vast country like China whose people, civilization, governmental policies and foreign relations impinge on internal Philippine developments. The paper proposes that any serious



study of social, economic and political developments of a small, developing country like the Philippines must take into account our relations with other countries, much more so with our relations with China. Finally, while the paper presents the technical and administrative problems that deter the full implementation of the projects, the discussion brings up the social-cultural circumstances that tend to impede successful completion of the projects, and provide tentative suggestions on how China's ODA projects may be improved.

## 1. China-funded Economic Assistance Projects

- **Philippine-Sino Center for Agricultural Technology (PhilSCAT).** The Department of Agriculture (DA) allocated P10.5 million for the construction of PhilSCAT, in Muñoz, Nueva Ecija. The project was completed in 2002. This is part of a US\$100 million official development assistance (ODA) from China. The project was implemented by the China National Construction and Agricultural Machinery Corporation that will supply the Philippines with agricultural machinery and technical assistance for testing hybrid rice varieties that were donated by China, supply of planters, harvesters, milling and drying machinery, and other post harvest technology and facilities.
- **The Banaoang I and II Pump Irrigation Project,** worth US\$35 million, is a supply contract by the China National Construction and Agricultural Machinery Import and Export Corporation to finance 90 percent of goods and services to implement the project.
- **The Banaoang I Irrigation Project** is expected to irrigate 6,000 hectares in six municipalities in Ilocos Sur. It involves the construction of irrigation channels, a bridge, a tunnel,

improvement of farm-to-market roads and drainage infrastructures as well as installation of power supply and electrical transmission lines.

- **The General Santos Fish Port Expansion Project** involves the construction of two wharves and dredging of the surrounding Sarangani Bay to allow docking of larger vessels. It includes construction of breakwater, a 3,000-metric ton capacity cold storage facility, additional wastewater treatment plant, power sub-station and provision of port hand-ling machinery and equipment, and a helipad.

Agricultural assistance programs that the Philippines and China have agreed to undertake were intended to foster the economic and agricultural development of the Philippines. The programs were in accordance with RA 8435, otherwise known as the Agriculture and Fisheries Modernization Act (AFMA), spearheaded by then Secretary of Agriculture Edgardo Angara during the Presidency of Joseph Estrada.

RA 8435 mandates the DA to:

- modernize the agriculture and fisheries sectors by transforming these sectors from a resource-based to a technology-based industry;
- enhance profits and incomes in the agricultural and fisheries sectors by ensuring equitable access to assets, resources, and services; and
- promote higher value-added processing agribusiness and aquaculture activities and agro-industrialization among others.

To meet these goals, the DA sought local funding through Annual General Appropriations, as well as DA Grants and Loans. The DA also initiated upon approval of the Department of Finance (DoF) credit from other countries with whom the Government of the Philippines has bilateral relations.



### 1.1 *Philippine-Sino Center for Agricultural Technology (PhilSCAT)*

The first project, PhilSCAT at the Central Luzon State University in Munoz, Nueva Ecija, is part of the US\$100 million aid agreement to our country entered into with the China National Construction and Agricultural Machinery Import and Export Corporation (CAMC) owned and operated by the government of the People's Republic of China. Under this agreement, the Philippines can avail of farm machinery, equipment and technical services from CAMC that cover the entire process of agricultural production.

CAMC provides mechanical transplanter, mechanical harvester, milling, drying machinery and other post-harvest equipment plus technical training of Filipinos in order to operate and maintain these machines. Several farm machineries were customized to meet specific Philippine conditions. CAMC agricultural and engineering experts provide continuing training for Filipinos under the supervision of Romeo Gavino, Filipino director and a faculty member of the Central Luzon State University, and Chinese agronomist Cheng Liangji. The Philippine side, through the DA, provided the land and allocated P10.5 million for the construction of PhilSCAT buildings and training facilities. The project was finished in 2002. However, the proposed farmers' service center did not materialize.

Chinese CAMC engineers and technicians demonstrated the efficacy of their agricultural machinery and equipment to the Filipino farmers. However, most of the farmers could not afford to buy the machinery. There is a need to provide credit to farmers and/or farmers' cooperatives that will administer and manage proper use, maintenance of machinery, and loan payments. PhilSCAT officials have submitted the second phase project proposal to the Philippine and Chinese governments to extend, expand, and develop innovative projects.

### 1.2 *Banaoang Irrigation Project*

The second project is a loan agreement amounting to US\$3.5 million to build irrigation works in Banaoang, Ilocos Sur. It intends to irrigate 6,000 hectares of rice lands to be implemented through the CAMC, the DA and the National Irrigation Administration (NIA).

An outcome of President Gloria M. Arroyo's visit to China when an agreement was signed with Ambassador Josue Villa, the project is supposed to benefit 6,000 farmers and would increase yield from two metric tons per hectare to five to six metric tons per hectare a year. It would also enable them to plant two crops per year. At present, Ilokano farmers resort to planting tobacco for lack of irrigation facilities. Water for irrigation will be drawn from the Abra River and would have a capacity of seven times 12 cubic meters.

The irrigation project is in the form of export credit facility for the construction, repair, and expansion of irrigation systems in Banaoang. The Banaoang I Pump Irrigation project is worth \$35 million and is expected to irrigate 6,000 hectares in six municipalities in Ilocos Sur. It also involves the construction and improvement of farm-to-market roads and drainage infrastructures, building of a tunnel and bridges across lateral irrigation channels, supply of electric power and putting up of transmission lines. Terms of reference have been undertaken in three stages: 1) detailed design; 2) tendering; 3) project implementation. A technical working group has been implementing the project since December 2000. Until his retirement, Edilberto Punzal, NIA project director, was in charge of the Banaoang I Pump Irrigation Project. He has been replaced by Engineer Jaime Paguio in the main office in Quezon City and site engineers Rex R. Rabanal and Arnulfo A. Lagasca in Banaoang.

Banaoang I is located in the area covering the municipalities of



Vigan, Bantay, San Vicente, San Ildefonso, Sto. Domingo, and Magsingal – all in the first district of Ilocos Sur. It is expected to irrigate 6,000 hectares and an estimated 5,215 farm households will directly benefit from the project. Implemented in 2003-2005, its estimated total cost is P1,340,310,000.00 billion. Local component is P585,063,000 million while the foreign component is P655,247,000 million.

The project taps water from the Abra River that flows from the mountains in the north going west to the West Philippine Sea (South China Sea) and its tributary that flows south will be the main source of irrigation water. The pumping station with seven units of electric-powered pumps was constructed at the right bank of the river at about 150 meters upstream of the Banaoang Bridge. A 15-kilometer, 67-kilovolts transmission line was installed from the National Power Corporation (NPC) sub-station at Bantay to the project site to provide the electric requirements. A 600-meter tunnel was also constructed to connect the pump station to the main canal. The total length of the main canal is about 20.60 kilometers and will distribute water through a network of lateral and sub-lateral canals. The project is estimated to be economically viable with an economic internal rate of return (EIRR) of 20.05 percent, way above the minimum 15 percent requirement set by our government.

To ensure that the project is environmentally sound, the project was submitted for evaluation to the Department of Energy and Natural Resources (DENR). And permission was obtained from the National Water Resources Board as well as from the Department of Energy to ensure that the supply of water and electricity is sufficient and economical. According to Director Punzal the project is important to the Ilocos farmers since the area is subject to periodic droughts.

The project is near completion but was halted due to the unforeseen occurrence of salt water in the lateral irrigation

channels. The discovery of brackish water in the irrigation channels necessitates extending the channels four kilometers more inland to tap sweet water that was not anticipated when the design and plans were drawn.

The extension requires additional funding amounting to P1.2 million. Because of the shortfall of funds, Banaoang I remains incomplete. The NIA, through the DA, is seeking approval of the Investment Coordination Committee (ICC), the National Economic Development Authority (NEDA) and the DoF for additional funds so that Banaoang I can eventually be completed and become fully operational.

### *1.3 General Santos Fish Port Project*

The third project is the General Santos Fish Port expansion project worth US\$30 million. It involves the construction of two wharves, a breakwater, a 3,000-metric ton capacity cold storage facility (at -40 to -45 degrees Celsius), additional waste water treatment plant, power sub-station and provision of port handling machinery and equipment and a helipad.

The NEDA ICC Technical Committee, DA's Philippine Fisheries Development Authority were asked to comply with additional requirements before the project was elevated for deliberation at the ICC-Cabinet level. The DA requested Chinese officials to further study the terms of conditions of the CAMC loan assistance in order to make it more attractive to the Philippine government and the private sector. Negotiations started in September 1999, when an agreement on cooperation in the field of agriculture and other related areas was forged between the Philippines and the government of the People's Republic of China.

Similarly, in May 2000, a memorandum of understanding on cooperation in the field of agriculture, irrigation, and other



related areas between the two countries was signed. To effect this MOU, a financial protocol was established in December 2000, defining the project areas where the supply credit will be used.

It is this financial protocol that contained the intention of the PROC to extend US\$100 million. Part of the money is an outright grant for the post-harvest facilities and farmers' training center that was undertaken in Muñoz, Nueva Ecija. The rest of the funds came in the form of export credit facility for repair, extension, and construction of the Ilocos Sur irrigation systems.

The improvement and expansion of the General Santos Fish Port is a continuation of an earlier project financed by the Japanese Overseas Economic Cooperation Fund (OECF) amounting to P600 million. The project consisted of providing post harvest facilities in Barangay Tamblar along the shores of Sarangani Bay, 32 kilometers south of the city proper. The port's harbor and landing facilities were opened to the public in July 1998 and became fully operational in February 1999.

While the General Santos Fish Port Complex was being constructed, the SOCCSKSARGEN (South Cotabato-Cotabato-Sultan Kudarat-Sarangani-General Santos) economic growth area was developing into a profitable business enclave and General Santos City has emerged as the region's principal fish trading zone. The rapidly increasing population in the area, as well as the establishment of the East ASEAN Growth Area (BIMP-EAGA, Brunei Darussalam-Indonesia-Malaysia-Philippines), have resulted in increased local and international demand for fish and fishery products, far greater than anticipated.

In response to the rapid economic development in the area and to cater to the mounting needs of the quickly developing industrial activities in fishing and processing, the private sector engaged in fishing and marketing activities. They utilize the port facilities and at the same time undertaking very substantial investments in establishing private jetties and cold storage

facilities of their own. This resulted in a lot of establishments scattered all over the waterfront area along the 10-kilometer long coastline. Thus, in order to centralize activities related to the unloading of fishing vessels and carriers and the proper handling and distribution of fish, the government decided that the existing facilities of the General Santos Fish Port Complex have to be improved and expanded.

When the supply credit between the DA as the implementing agency and the CAMC took effect, the expansion project of General Santos Fish Port Complex was implemented in three years. Aimed to benefit fishing vessel operators, fish processors, and fish canneries, this project involves the construction of the following additional facilities: 500 meters deep draft wharves to accommodate large tonnage fishing vessels over 300 GRT; 1500 MY cold storage facility; 500 cubic meters waste water treatment plant; 650 KVA power sub-station with 600 KW, 750 KVA stand-by generator set; and wharf handling machinery and equipment.

According to Engr. Rodrigo Bulaon, who oversees the General Santos Fish Port facilities, the General Santos Fish Port, together with the other projects undertaken by the DA with CAMC, will definitely increase employment opportunities and improve the quality of fish products to make Philippine marine exports more competitive in the international market.

## 2. Success and Challenges

The successful implementation of these three projects can be attributed to the careful adherence of all DA line agencies to the laws, regulations and other requirements of all the concerned agencies of our government. All of the projects undertaken by the DA were scrutinized by the ICC Technical Board who



deliberated on the proposals and once approved needed favorable recommendation not only from the ICC Technical Board but also the ICC Cabinet Committee.

After approval by these two entities, the proposals were submitted to the NEDA Board whose approval was needed before the projects could be implemented. Only then could projects be assured of allocation of funds drawn from the national budget to meet the cost of the projects and other financial obligations under the loan agreements.

Other ODA projects were not implemented. Apparently, the projects on the expansion of the north and south railways and the broadband project with ZTE were signed at the top level of government. Unlike the three ODA projects discussed earlier, the expansion of the north and south railway lines, and the broadband project were signed without going through the long and difficult process of scrutiny and approval of all the agencies and entities concerned.

Adding to the difficulties and hindrances in carrying out the railway and ZTE projects was the alleged over pricing of the projects and other anomalous payments to certain individuals and groups. Exacerbating the nullification of these projects was the hostility of opposition parties to the Arroyo government that beclouded rational and scientific assessment of all joint projects with China. Hence, DA personnel are pessimistic about the implementation of several key economic assistance projects being proposed to China for funding. These are Banaoang II Irrigation project in Ilocos Sur, Balingasog irrigation project in Maguindanao, and the improvement and expansion of the Navotas fish port in Manila. Apparently, the fiasco of the railway and ZTE projects deters all government deliberations on these proposed and economically vital projects.

Two additional project proposals are being pursued but not implemented: the grain processing project of Central

Isulan Multi-Purpose Cooperative in Sultan Kudarat, Central Mindanao and a mango processing project of the Isabela Mango Growers Development Cooperative. An MOU was signed among the DA, through the Bureau of Post-Harvest Research and Extension (BPHE), the Isulan Multi-Purpose Cooperative Inc., and two Chinese corporations – China Technical Import and Export Corporation (CNTIC) and Golden Harvest Global Corporation (GHGC). A project feasibility study was prepared and the loan agreement is being worked out. Likewise, an MOU was signed among the DA, BPHE, the Isabela Mango Growers' Cooperative, and China's CNTIC and GHGC. The feasibility study is being reviewed by the BPHE.

### 3. Social-Cultural Deterrents in Implementing China-funded Projects

The main hindrance in the smooth implementation of these projects, according to the DA personnel, is language barrier. It takes hours before both sides could agree on any issue due to the laborious process of translation. Field workers are often at a loss when there is no competent interpreter-translator available.

Also a hindrance is the confusion among the Chinese engineers and experts due to the many layers of Philippine bureaucracy that requires so much paper work and the need of negotiating with many different personnel at different levels who are often replaced or transferred when top government officials change. The Chinese also complain of lack of coordination among the different government agencies: the DA with the ICC and NEDA, DFA and the Department of Finance, and the local government units (LGU).

Another irritant is the very strict and rigid method in the issuing of visas to the Chinese engineers and technicians who are



made to undergo stern examination by Philippine Immigration and Customs officers. This is due to the difficulty of ascertaining the identities of Chinese nationals entering the country whose names are often similar to those suspected of criminal activities. Moreover, most of the Filipino engineers and experts are accustomed to the United States, European Union, and Japanese machinery and equipment, most of them having been trained in the countries concerned. It will take time for the Filipinos to understand, familiarize themselves and trust Chinese-made machinery and technology which are all new to them.

It should be pointed out that the Chinese engineers and technicians customized the China-made farm machinery and equipment used at PhilSCAT demonstration farms. Despite these difficulties, the projects were successfully implemented due to the high level of expertise, patience and industry of Filipino and Chinese personnel. Other problems that usually arise with respect to infrastructure projects are the need to maintain, upgrade, and safeguard the structures and machinery.

Addressing the technical and construction aspects is not sufficient. Equally important is social and political organization in the communities where the infrastructure is located. In the case of the irrigation projects in Ilocos Sur, the beneficiaries of the irrigation works and the communities in the area need to be organized to help the DA and NIA in taking care of the structures, and organize mode of use and distribution of water, and accompanying responsibilities. Perhaps, there is a need to resuscitate the indigenous Ilokano Sangria system that traditionally took care of building, maintaining, and supervising proper use of facilities, water distribution and in meeting financial obligations. The DA and NIA personnel are technical people and are not equipped to undertake social mobilization. They could, however, assign this task to another DA agency, the Bureau of Agricultural Extension.

They can also solicit the help of the respective local government officials in the area. Instead of inviting them only during ribbon-cutting ceremonies, the DA can appeal to them to share part of their countryside development funds to organize community support, maintenance of infrastructure and facilities and help meet financial obligations. Ilocos Sur Rep. Ronald V. Singson, Nueva Ecija Rep. Eduardo Nonato Joson, and General Santos Rep. Darlene Antonino-Custodio should be made aware of the benefits of the infrastructure to their district as well as the obligations to maintain and upgrade the facilities.

Moreover, there is need to ensure that these infrastructure and facilities benefit the small farmers and fisherfolk rather than big multinational agricultural and fishing corporations. Many of the individual small-scale farmers and fisherfolk cannot afford to pay for the cost of the agricultural machinery and fish port facilities. This requires extension of credit and organizing small individual farmers and fisherfolk into cooperatives so that they can share benefits and costs.

#### 4. Tentative Suggestions for Improving Implementation of China-funded Projects

In order to improve and enhance relations with China and derive as much benefit from economic development aid and other loan agreements.

1. Renegotiate terms of loan lower than three percent per annum.
2. Ask for longer period of repayment from 10 year period to 20-25.
3. Reduce the required 10 percent down payment of the total cost to 5 percent or better still 0 percent.
4. Include inflation rates in the computation of funding.



5. Review and re-assess projects for their cost-effectiveness and ecological sustainability.
6. Better coordination of all government officials from the national to the local levels.
7. Employ the best and most effective experts and specialists to train local personnel.

In conclusion, we should not lose sight of the whole purpose of economic development assistance. All projects should benefit the majority of our people especially primary producers – the farmers and the fisherfolk, and make sure that every sector helps in conserving the environment.

## Perspectives on Joint Development in the South China Sea<sup>1</sup>

*Aileen San Pablo-Baviera*

### 1. The Joint Development Concept in the Philippine Imagination

The idea of “joint development” of resources in the South China Sea has been an option in the consciousness of Filipino leaders at least since June 1986, when Deng Xiaoping was reported to have told Vice President Salvador P. Laurel of China’s proposed formula to “shelve sovereignty issues and go for joint development.” “We should leave aside the issue of the Nansha Islands for a while. We should not let this issue stand in the way of China’s friendship with the Philippines and with other countries,” Deng was quoted as saying (“Set aside” MOFA).

The same message was relayed in 1988 to President Corazon C. Aquino, when Deng pledged to shelve the sovereignty issue, engage in joint exploration and development, and work towards a peaceful resolution of the issue (Baviera, qtd. in Tang, Li and Acharya, eds. 173-192). “In view of the friendly relations between our two countries, we can set aside this issue for the time being

---

<sup>1</sup> Based on a paper presented at the 4th Conference on “Sealanes of Communication” organized by the National Defense University in Taipei, Taiwan on September 26, 2012.